



City of Winooski

Winooski Fire Department

120 Main Street
Winooski Vermont 05404
802 655 6420
winooski.vt.gov/fire

Memorandum

June 15, 2022

To: Elaine Wang, City Manager

From: John Audy, Jr., Fire Chief
Bruce Palmer, Fire Marshal

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be "JA", written over the names of the Fire Chief and Fire Marshal.

Re: Recommendation to Award Aerial Replacement Contract

In 2019 our department began the process of evaluating current capabilities of our existing 1999 Sutphen 70ft tower, this included department staff meetings internally, seeing 6-7 demo trucks and operating them within the city, and evaluating operational needs and limitations. Externally, staff have researched apparatus and vendors, to the best of our abilities projecting future growth and development, service demands, staffing, and mission. Additionally, we created a project budget, obtained a positive bond vote for \$1.3m, and finally prepared an apparatus specification.

A Request For Proposal (RFP) was issued following the current city guidelines, policies, and procedures on May 20, 2022 and advertised as such. Additionally this was sent directly to E-ONE (Desorcie Emergency Products, LLC), Sutphen (Dingee Machine Company), and Pierce (Allegiance Fire & Rescue) as we had spent time with all three of these vendors. It was also directly sent to Toyne Fire Apparatus.

On June 13, 2022 a public bid opening took place and the following bids were received:

E-ONE \$1,283,757.00 *Includes \$55,000.00 trade-in of 1999 Sutphen Tower at time of delivery.
Sutphen \$1,295,777.00 *Includes \$37,500.00 trade-in of 1999 Sutphen Tower at time of delivery.

- It is unknown what/why Pierce did not bid.
- Toyne was unable to bid because they are not a sole source vendor i.e. they buy all components and assemble. They do not manufacture.

Recommendation:

As Fire Chief and Fire Marshal we are recommending (for the reasons listed below- but not limited to) the contract be awarded to E-One/Desorcie Emergency Products, LLC. for a 2024 E-One Typhoon HR100 SRA (Single Rear Axle) Quint. While both proposals in large part met the desired "minimum qualifications/specifications", the HR100 presented as the apparatus that is best suited to meet the demands of being a multifaceted 1st due apparatus within our community and for our staff. There are literally hundreds of options that each vendor offers in varying levels of

complexity. The challenge was/is to evaluate those to assure the community's needs and safety of our staff are accounted for.

Community Needs: Our community continues to grow, specifically continues to grow "UP" as new and future development happens. This new development has and will continue to bring multi-story buildings that in many cases we cannot reach with the current 70ft Tower. We currently rely on mutual aid to access many of our new buildings due to these reach limitations. In addition to new development current and future street scenes will change i.e. Main Street project will narrow travel lanes, this will again increase reach demands by moving our "set-up" area further from the buildings i.e. the further away we are the less reach we have.

The HR100 SRA Quint increases our reach capacity to 100ft (up from 70ft), is compact with an overall length of 41'2" (current tower is 40'6"), and stabilizer "jack spread" of 11ft. The stabilizer "jack spread" is the foot-print the apparatus needs to set-up. In addition the rear of this apparatus is designed with 45 degree rear corners, this will again improve maneuverability and enhance firefighter safety.

In comparison the Sutphen SL100 was also a 100ft aerial device, has overall length of 44'8", and stabilizer "jack spread" of 18ft.

Department Needs: Our department has worked hard to define its mission and align itself with our community. This includes evaluating equipment and apparatus. Better understanding our community, what's in our community, our limitations i.e. staffing, and remaining committed to our Community Risk Reduction efforts guided and lead us while doing this work.

The HR100 SRA Quint uniquely enhances one of our biggest shortcomings, "reach," while at the same time remaining VERY similar in size to our current Tower. Both are single axle and very close in length. This is important on several fronts, the most important being drivability. As a combination department we rely heavily on part-time on-call staff who often times have never driven a large vehicle. It is a real challenge to train new firefighters to fight fires, but even more challenging to train them to safely drive and operate fire apparatus. Additionally we feel the HR100 Quint best supports 2-3 person operations, as the 1st due apparatus for most calls features such as having the rescue basket on the aerial i.e. not having to bring it up, and/or having the ability to reload hose without moving the aerial device out of the way are a couple examples.

In comparison the Sutphen SL100 is a tandem axle (two axles vs one axle) truck and would be longer by about 3'6". While this length and additional drivetrain do have benefits i.e. more compartment space, larger water capacity, we feel the driveability of this larger apparatus will be further limited than the HR100 among staff. Additionally it is unknown what additional or future maintenance cost would/will be for operating a tandem axle i.e. extra tires, wear and tear.

Service: The local E-One authorized dealer is Desorcie Emergency Products, LLC. They are located in St. Albans, VT and capable of servicing apparatus in-station or at their facility and currently have two full-time factory trained service techs. General maintenance and repairs of the chassis will continue to be performed locally by our preferred vendor such as Charlebois of Milton or Lucky's Trailer Sales in Colchester.

In comparison the Sutphen authorized dealer, Dingee Machine Company is located in Cornish New Hampshire. While service has always been provided (both in house and at their facility) it is challenging to coordinate and/or physically get apparatus to their shop when needed. This typically requires that we meet along I-89 corridor before entering New Hampshire, this happens because New Hampshire requires Commercial Driver's Licenses to operate apparatus.

Interoperability: E-One currently has apparatus in Burlington, Colchester, and St. Michael's College

to name only some of the closest to us. It will only benefit all departments that work closely together to have "like" equipment, this is especially true as our relationship continues to grow with St. Michael's.

Cost: E-One was the low bidder, although cost was not the deciding factor we fully understand and acknowledge the need to be good stewards of appropriated funds (i.e. staying within budget). This has been challenging given the current economic climate and uncertainties within the labor market and supply chains. We feel that E-One's proposal for a HR100 SRA Quint strikes a good balance of cost vs benefit and addresses current needs while allowing for future community and department growth.

In conclusion, after an extensive multi-year process we recommending and ask for the award and approval of the bid by E-One/Desorcie Emergency Products, LLC to supply the City of Winooski with its next aerial, an 2024 E-One Typhoon HR100 SRA Quint. Execution of contract once approved is anticipated by June 30, 2022 with a anticipated delivery timeline of 655 calendar days (22-24 months).